

The Italian Yearbook of International Law

The Italian Yearbook of International Law

VOLUME 34

The titles published in this series are listed at *brill.com/tyil*

**The Italian Yearbook of
International Law
Volume XXXIV (2024)**



BRILL | NIJHOFF

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISSN 0391-5107

E-ISSN 2211-6133

ISBN 978-90-04-75623-6 (hardback)

Copyright 2025 by Koninklijke Brill BV, Plantijnstraat 2, 2321 JC Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill BV incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Schöningh, Brill Fink, Brill mentis, Brill Wageningen Academic, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Böhlau and V&R unipress.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission from the publisher. Requests for re-use and/or translations must be addressed to Koninklijke Brill BV via brill.com or copyright.com.

For more information: info@brill.com.

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

Founded in 1975 by FRANCESCO CAPOTORTI, BENEDETTO CONFORTI,
and LUIGI FERRARI BRAVO

BOARD OF EDITORS

PIA ACCONCI, *University of Teramo*; GIUSEPPE CATALDI, *University of Napoli L'Orientale*;
SERENA FORLATI, *University of Ferrara*; PIETRO GARGIULO, *University of Teramo*; MARCO
GESTRI, *University of Modena and Reggio Emilia* (Book Review Editor); MASSIMO IOVANE,
University of Napoli Federico II; MARINA MANCINI, *Mediterranean University of Reggio
Calabria*; GIUSEPPE NESI, *University of Trento*; RICCARDO PAVONI, *University of Siena*
(General Editor); NATALINO RONZITTI, *LUISS Guido Carli University, Rome*; GIORGIO
SACERDOTI, *Bocconi University, Milan*; NIGEL WHITE, *University of Nottingham*

Associate Editor: DANIELE AMOROSO, *University of Cagliari*

EDITORIAL COMMITTEE

GIULIO BARTOLINI, *University of Roma Tre*; LEONARDO BORLINI, *Bocconi University, Milan*; MARTINA
BUSCEMI, *University of Milano*; ANDREA CALIGIURI, *University of Macerata*; ALESSANDRO CHECHI,
University of Geneva; FEDERICO LENZERINI, *University of Siena*; RAFFAELLA NIGRO, *Magna Graecia
University of Catanzaro*; MARCO PERTILE, *University of Trento*; PIERFRANCESCO ROSSI, *University of
Teramo*; ELENA SCISO, *LUISS Guido Carli University, Rome*; STEFANO SILINGARDI, *University of Milano*;
PAOLO TURRINI, *University of Trento*; VALENTINA VADI, *University of Padova*

Editorial assistance for this volume has been provided by Mariangela Carroll Sullivan.

Manuscripts, books for review and correspondence may be sent to THE ITALIAN YEARBOOK OF
INTERNATIONAL LAW - Prof. Daniele Amoroso, Dipartimento di Giurisprudenza, University of Cagliari,
Viale Sant'Ignazio 17, 09123 Cagliari (Italy) and/or by e-mail to italianyearbook@gmail.com.

Each article submitted with a view to publication in the IYIL is subject to peer review by two anonymous
referees.

CONTENTS

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	XIII
FOREWORD	XVII
THE UNITED NATIONS AT 80: CONTESTATION, RESILIENCE AND CHANGE	
HOW DO NATIONS UNITE WITHIN THE UNITED NATIONS? COALITIONS AND DIVIDES IN INTERNATIONAL LAW-MAKING <i>Santiago Villalpando</i>	3
BINDING SETTLEMENT OF INTER-STATE DISPUTES: THE UNITED NATIONS BETWEEN RESILIENCE AND RESIGNATION <i>Christian J. Tams</i>	21
THE UN AND THE ICC: NAVIGATING THE PERSISTENT TENSION BETWEEN PEACE AND JUSTICE <i>Alessandra Annoni</i>	47
THE UNITED NATIONS AND THE REINVENTION OF PEACE: WHICH PEACE AND FOR WHOM? <i>Chiara Redaelli</i>	67
HUMAN RIGHTS AT THE UNITED NATIONS BETWEEN UNIVERSALISM AND MULTICULTURALISM <i>Rosario Sapienza</i>	99
SUSTAINING CHANGE: THE ROLE OF THE UNITED NATIONS IN PROMOTING ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AMID RISING DISCONTENT <i>Elena Fasoli</i>	117
THE SPECIALISED AGENCIES AND THEIR RELATIONSHIP WITH THE UNITED NATIONS: MEMBERSHIP AND REPRESENTATION ISSUES <i>Annamaria Viterbo</i>	135
ARTICLES, NOTES AND COMMENTS	
WHICH TREATIES OVERRIDE INCONSISTENT DOMESTIC LEGISLATION UNDER ARTICLE 117(1) OF THE ITALIAN CONSTITUTION? TAKING STOCK OF A QUARTER- CENTURY OF PRACTICE <i>Donato Greco and Riccardo Pavoni</i>	157

PIRACY: A NOTABLE <i>OMNIS DEFINITIO</i> INSTANCE <i>Tullio Scovazzi</i>	183
THE NEW CHALLENGES FOR INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION IN HEALTHCARE AND PUBLIC HEALTH <i>Cristina Campiglio</i>	217
<i>CANNAVACCIUOLO V. ITALY</i> : A CAUTIOUS STEP IN PROTECTING THE RIGHT TO LIFE AGAINST ENVIRONMENTAL HARM <i>Federica Passarini</i>	235
CONFISCATION OF ARCHAEOLOGICAL PROPERTY: THE JUDGMENT OF THE EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS IN <i>J. PAUL GETTY TRUST V. ITALY</i> <i>Alessandra Lanciotti</i>	251
THE ITALY-ALBANIA PROTOCOL ON THE EXTRATERRITORIAL DETENTION OF MIGRANTS: CRITICAL ISSUES IN INTERNATIONAL LAW <i>Anna Fazzini</i>	273
 PRACTICE OF INTERNATIONAL COURTS AND TRIBUNALS 	
THE GENOCIDE CONVENTION BEFORE THE ICJ: JUDICIAL PROTECTION OF FUNDAMENTAL VALUES BETWEEN TRADITION, INNOVATION, AND THE RISK OF FUTILITY <i>Serena Forlati</i>	295
COOPERATION WITH THE ICC AND PERSONAL IMMUNITIES OF HEADS OF STATE OR GOVERNMENT OF NON-PARTIES: REVISITING ARTICLES 27 AND 98 OF THE ROME STATUTE AFTER THE COURT'S FINDING ON MONGOLIA'S NON-COMPLIANCE <i>Raffaella Nigro and Emma Luce Scali</i>	319
THE WTO DISPUTE SETTLEMENT SYSTEM 2023-2024: NAVIGATING THE CRISIS, ENGAGING IN REFORM, ADDRESSING TRADE AND CLIMATE CHANGE <i>Giorgio Sacerdoti and Carlo de Stefano</i>	343
THE 2024 CASE LAW OF INVESTMENT TRIBUNALS: EARLY EFFECTS OF THE ICSID RULES AMENDMENTS AND THE ISSUE OF SECURITY FOR COSTS <i>Giuliana Lampo</i>	363
 ITALIAN PRACTICE RELATING TO INTERNATIONAL LAW 	
<i>Classification Scheme</i>	385

JUDICIAL DECISIONS

(edited by *Daniele Amoroso* and *Andrea Caligiuri*)

V. IMMUNITIES

CHINA'S IMMUNITY FROM COVID-19 COMPENSATION CLAIMS: A NOVEL INTERPRETATION OF THE HUMANITARIAN EXCEPTION BY THE COURT OF CASSATION? (note by *Eugenio Carli*)

Corte di Cassazione (Sezioni Unite Civili), 11 June 2024, No. 16136 (Order)
I.P. v. People's Republic of China 387

VII. LAW OF THE SEA

SOVEREIGNTY CANNOT BE DIVIDED: THE CONSTITUTIONAL COURT'S VIEW ON THE BIZARRE NOTION OF "REGIONAL TERRITORIAL SEA" (note by *Simone Carrea*)

Corte Costituzionale, 24 January 2024, No. 16
Presidenza del Consiglio dei Ministri v. Regione Puglia 392

FLAG STATE OBLIGATIONS IN SEARCH AND RESCUE BEYOND TERRITORIAL WATERS: INSIGHTS FROM THE ASSO 28 CASE (note by *Fiammetta Borgia*)

Corte di Cassazione (Sez. V Penale), *Criminal Proceedings against Giuseppe Sotgiù ("Asso 28 case")*, 1 February 2024, No. 4557 394

XI. TREATMENT OF ALIENS AND NATIONALITY

THE COURT OF CASSATION'S TAKE ON THE PRINCIPLE OF NON-PUNISHMENT OF VICTIMS OF HUMAN TRAFFICKING: BETWEEN INTERPRETATIVE EFFORTS AND SYSTEMIC SHORTCOMINGS (note by *Elena Ardito*)

Corte di Cassazione (Sez. VI Penale), 18 January 2024, No. 2319
Criminal Proceedings against O.L. and O.M. 399

LEGAL SAFEGUARDS AGAINST THE SECURITARIAN APPROACH TO MIGRATION: THE COURT OF CASSATION ON EXPULSION AS AN ALTERNATIVE SANCTION TO DETENTION (note by *Giulia Ciliberto*)

Corte di Cassazione (Sez. I Penale), 26 November 2024, No. 43082
Criminal Proceedings against Fa. Gr. 404

XIX. ARMED CONFLICT, NEUTRALITY, AND DISARMAMENT

THE CONTRIBUTION OF THE COURT OF CASSATION TO THE DEFINITION OF MERCENARIES (note by *Eleonora Branca*)

	<i>Corte di Cassazione (Sez. I Penale)</i> , 21 June 2024, No. 24752 <i>Criminal Proceedings against Andrea Palmeri</i>	
	<i>Corte di Cassazione (Sez. I Penale)</i> , 21 June 2024, No. 24753 <i>Criminal Proceedings against Vladimir Verbitchii</i>	406
	DISTINGUISHING ARMED RESISTANCE FROM TERRORISM AGAINST A FOREIGN STATE: THE COURT OF CASSATION'S TARGET-BASED APPROACH AND THE IRRELEVANCE OF <i>LOCUS COMMISSI DELICTI</i> (note by <i>Luca Poltronieri Rossetti</i>)	
	<i>Corte di Cassazione (Sez. VI Penale)</i> , 20 August 2024, No. 32712 <i>Criminal Proceedings against Yaeesh Anan Kamal Afif</i>	410
	DIPLOMATIC AND PARLIAMENTARY PRACTICE (edited by <i>Pietro Gargiulo</i> , <i>Marco Pertile</i> and <i>Paolo Turrini</i>)	
XI.	TREATMENT OF ALIENS AND NATIONALITY	
	ITALY'S MIGRATION POLICY IN 2024: PURSUING THE EXTERNALISATION PATH (note by <i>Chiara Tea Antoniazzi</i>)	417
XII.	HUMAN RIGHTS	
	THE ARREST AND DETENTION OF ILARIA SALIS IN HUNGARY (note by <i>Caterina Milo</i>)	422
XIII.	INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL LAW	
	THE ENFORCEMENT OF ARREST WARRANTS ISSUED BY THE INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL COURT: BETWEEN THE DUTY TO COOPERATE AND <i>REALPOLITIK</i> (note by <i>Luca Poltronieri Rossetti</i>)	426
XIX.	ARMED CONFLICT, NEUTRALITY, AND DISARMAMENT	
	ITALY'S SUPPORT TO UKRAINE'S WAR EFFORT: NEITHER UNCONDITIONAL MILITARY AID, NOR UNCONDITIONAL PEACE (note by <i>Paolo Turrini</i>)	432
	THE ONGOING REFORM OF THE ITALIAN LAW ON ARMS EXPORT AND RECENT POLICY TRENDS IN THIS FIELD (note by <i>Filomena Medea Tulli</i>)	443
	ITALY'S STANCE ON THE ISRAELI-PALESTINIAN QUESTION AND THE GAZA WAR: CONTINUITY AND CHANGE (note by <i>Giulia Cagol</i>)	448
	BIBLIOGRAPHIES	
	ITALIAN BIBLIOGRAPHICAL INDEX OF INTERNATIONAL LAW 2024 (edited by <i>Giulio Bartolini</i> and <i>Alessandro Chechi</i>)	459

BOOK REVIEWS

(edited by *Marco Gestri*)

493

STEFAN TALMON (ed.), *German Practice in International Law*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, Volume 1, 2019, Volume 2, 2020 (*Marco Pertile*); DAVID KENNEDY and MARTTI KOSKENNIEMI, *Of Law and the World: Critical Conversations on Power, History, and Political Economy*, Cambridge, Massachusetts/London, Harvard University Press, 2023 (*Leonardo Borlini*); ROBERTO LOUVIN and MICHELE VELLANO (eds.), *Monte Bianco: La montagna senza confini* (Mont Blanc: Mountain without Borders), Milano, Wolters Kluwer Italia/Cedam, 2024 (*Massimo Starita*); MASSIMO IOVANE, FULVIO MARIA PALOMBINO, GIOVANNI ZARRA, LORIS MAROTTI, DOMENICO PAUCIULO, ALESSANDRO STIANO and DONATO GRECO (eds.), *L'arbitrato internazionale nell'interazione tra sistemi normativi* (International Arbitration in the Interaction between Legal Systems), Napoli, Editoriale Scientifica, 2024 (*Stefano Silingardi*); GUSTAVO MINERVINI, *Shareholder Claims in International Law*, Torino, Giappichelli, 2024 (*Stefano Silingardi*); ANA FILIPA VRDOLJAK, ANDRZEJ JAKUBOWSKI and ALESSANDRO CHECHI (eds.), *The 1970 UNESCO and 1995 UNIDROIT Conventions on Stolen or Illegally Transferred Cultural Property: A Commentary*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2024 (*Irene Pancani*); SARAH CASSELLA and ROBERTO VIRZO (eds.), *Le contrôle international* (International Control), Paris, Pedone, 2024 (*Claudia Candelmo*).

INDEX

531

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

Periodicals*

AFDI	Annuaire Français de Droit International
AJIL	American Journal of International Law
ASIL	American Society of International Law Proceedings
AVR	Archiv des Völkerrecht
BISD	GATT – Basic Instruments and Selected Documents
BYIL	British Yearbook of International Law
CI	La Comunità Internazionale
CJIL	Chinese Journal of International Law
CML Rev.	Common Market Law Review
Columbia JTL	Columbia Journal of Transnational Law
Cornell ILJ	Cornell International Law Journal
CS	Comunicazioni e Studi
CYIL	Canadian Yearbook of International Law
DCI	Diritto del Commercio Internazionale
DCSI	Diritto Comunitario e degli Scambi Internazionali
DPCE	Diritto Pubblico Comparato ed Europeo
DUDI	Diritti Umani e Diritto Internazionale
DUE	Il Diritto dell'Unione Europea
ECLR	European Competition Law Review
ECR	European Court Reports
EdD	Enciclopedia del Diritto
EG	Enciclopedia Giuridica (Treccani)
EHRR	European Human Rights Reports
EJIL	European Journal of International Law
EL Rev.	European Law Review
ETS	European Treaty Series
Foro It.	Foro Italiano
Giur. Cost.	Giurisprudenza Costituzionale
Giur. It.	Giurisprudenza Italiana
GU	Gazzetta Ufficiale della Repubblica Italiana
GYIL	German Yearbook of International Law
Harvard ILJ	Harvard International Law Journal
HRLJ	Human Rights Law Journal
ICJ Pleadings	International Court of Justice, Pleadings, Oral Arguments, Documents

* The present list covers only the most frequently cited periodicals.

ICJ Reports	International Court of Justice, Reports of Judgments, Advisory Opinions and Orders
ICLQ	International and Comparative Law Quarterly
IJCP	International Journal of Cultural Property
ILDC	International Law in Domestic Courts
ILM	International Legal Materials
ILR	International Law Reports
Int. Lawyer	International Lawyer
IOLR	International Organizations Law Review
IRRC	International Review of the Red Cross
IYIL	Italian Yearbook of International Law
JDI	Journal du Droit International
JICJ	Journal of International Criminal Justice
JIEL	Journal of International Economic Law
JWT	Journal of World Trade
Leiden JIL	Leiden Journal of International Law
Max Planck UNYB	Max Planck Yearbook of United Nations Law
NILR	Netherlands International Law Review
NYIL	Netherlands Yearbook of International Law
OIDU	Ordine Internazionale e Diritti Umani
OJ EC	Official Journal of the European Communities
OJ EU	Official Journal of the European Union
PCIJ Series	Permanent Court of International Justice, Series
QIL	Questions of International Law
RBDI	Revue Belge de Droit International
RCADI	Recueil des Cours de l'Académie de Droit International de La Haye/Collected Courses of the Hague Academy of International Law
RCGI	Rivista della Cooperazione Giuridica Internazionale
RDI	Rivista di Diritto Internazionale
RDIPP	Rivista di Diritto Internazionale Privato e Processuale
RECIEL	Review of European Community and International Environmental Law/ Review of European, Comparative and International Environmental Law
RGA	Rivista Giuridica dell'Ambiente
RGDIP	Revue Générale de Droit International Public
RIDPC	Rivista Italiana di Diritto Pubblico Comunitario
RMUE	Revue du Marché Unique Européen
RTDH	Revue Trimestrielle des Droits de l'Homme
Schw. ZIER	Schweizerische Zeitschrift für Internationales und Europäisches Recht
Texas ILJ	Texas International Law Journal
UNTS	United Nations Treaty Series
Yale JIL	Yale Journal of International Law
YEL	Yearbook of European Law
YIEL	Yearbook of International Environmental Law

YIHL	Yearbook of International Humanitarian Law
YILC/ACDI	Yearbook of the International Law Commission/ Annuaire de la Commission du droit international
ZAÖRV	Zeitschrift für Ausländisches Öffentliches Recht und Völkerrecht

Italian legal acts

Law	Legge (Act of Parliament)
DL	Decreto Legge (Decree-Law) (Decree adopted by the Government in case of extreme urgency which has the same, albeit provisional, effect of a Law, and which must be approved by the Parliament within 60 days. On the contrary, it loses its legal effect)
D.Lgs.	Decreto Legislativo (Legislative Decree) (Decree adopted by the Government upon delegation by the Parliament)
DPR	Decreto del Presidente della Repubblica (Decree of the President of the Republic)
DPCM	Decreto Presidente del Consiglio dei Ministri (Decree of the President of the Council of Ministers or Prime Minister)
DM	Decreto Ministeriale (Ministerial Decree)
Reg.	Regolamento (Administrative Regulation)

ITALIAN COURTS

<i>Tribunale</i>	Court of First Instance
<i>Corte d'Appello</i>	Court of Appeals
<i>Corte di Cassazione</i>	Court of Cassation
TAR	Regional Administrative Tribunal
<i>Consiglio di Stato</i>	Council of State (Supreme Administrative Court)
<i>Corte Costituzionale</i>	Constitutional Court

FOREWORD

Volume 34 of the *IYIL* begins with a section entitled “The United Nations at 80: Contestation, Resilience and Change”. It contains a set of articles covering distinct aspects of the structure, activities, and functions of the United Nations on the occasion of its eightieth anniversary. When selecting this theme for the lead section of the volume, it was certainly not the Editors’ intention to invite celebratory pieces uncritically praising what the UN has realized over the past 80 years. In the face of ongoing mounting attacks on the UN, we were rather convinced that it was appropriate to advise the authors to address their respective topics in a balanced manner, highlighting shortcomings, achievements, and challenges, without losing sight of the fact that dismantling the UN, in the absence of any plausible alternative, would most likely turn out to be a cure much worse than the disease. Earlier versions of the published papers were presented at the *IYIL* annual workshop held at the Department of Law of the University of Ferrara on 28-29 November 2024. We are deeply grateful to Serena Forlati for her organizational efforts and hospitality in Ferrara. We also acknowledge the financial support for the workshop and production of the volume by the following publishing houses: Editoriale Scientifica, Giappichelli Editore, and Edizioni Scientifiche Italiane.

Volume 34 next features various articles, notes, and comments mostly focusing on key aspects of the Italian practice of international law, such as the hierarchical rank of treaties in the Italian legal order, recent prominent pronouncements of the European Court of Human Rights involving Italy as the respondent, and the notorious Italy-Albania Protocol on co-operation in migratory issues. As per tradition, further extensive coverage of relevant Italian judicial practice and diplomatic and parliamentary practice in 2024 is included in the dedicated sections of the volume.

The part dealing with the practice of international courts and tribunals has been revamped. Rather than providing horizontal overviews of recent activities of selected judicial institutions and bodies, it now features scholarly pieces thoroughly addressing specific key questions raised by those activities, such as the ICJ and the Genocide Convention, and the ICC and personal immunities of heads of State or Government of non-parties to the Rome Statute.

A comprehensive Italian bibliographical index of international law and several book reviews occupy the remainder of the volume.

Starting with this volume, Serena Forlati is a member of the Board of Editors, while we welcome Martina Buscemi and Stefano Silingardi as new members of the Editorial Committee. We are grateful to them for their dedication and support to the *IYIL* enterprise.

Heartfelt thanks go to the many anonymous peer reviewers who have vastly contributed to the finalization of the volume, to Pierfrancesco Rossi for his superb copy-editing work, and to Daniele Amoroso for his tireless engagement with each and every scholarly and practical facet of the volume.

RP